

DOSSIER

INFORMATION SUBSIDY DURING THE PANDEMIC: a case in Indonesian journalism



VINISA NURUL AISYAH¹

Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta, Surakarta Indonesia

ORCID: 0009-0009-8308-6244

DIMAS ARYO ANGGORO²

Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta, Surakarta Indonesia

ORCID: 0000-0002-0061-6337

DOI: 10.25200/BJR.v20n2.2024.1635

Received in: July 31st, 2023

Desk Reviewed in: September 25th, 2023

Desk Review Editor: Laura Storch

Revised on: March 07th, 2024

Revised on: March 28th, 2024

Approved on: March 31st, 2024

ABSTRACT – This research analyzes the subsidy information during the covid-19 pandemic from the Indonesian Government's press release to mass media news. Information subsidies are a compelling practice to study since they describe how information flows in society. This practice becomes unavoidable, especially during the pandemic, which implies restrictions on activities and social distancing. This research used framing analysis and quantitative methods. The results indicated practices of information subsidies with a total of 95.65% from the Indonesian government press release samples published by mass media in the form of news in the same period. The analysis showed no significant difference between information from government press releases and news on detik.com through analysis of dominant frame, episodic and thematic framing, emotional appeal, gain-loss framing, sourcing news, and news tone. It is feared that the practice of information subsidies will lead to the degeneration of social responsibility from the mass media and eliminate the data verification process in journalism.

Keywords: Framing analysis. News. Press release. Subsidies information.

1 Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta, Surakarta – Indonesia. E-mail: Vna409@ums.ac.id

2 Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta, Surakarta – Indonesia. E-mail: daa310@ums.ac.id

PRÁTICAS DE SUBSÍDIO DE INFORMAÇÕES DURANTE A PANDEMIA: um caso no jornalismo Indonésio

RESUMO – Esta pesquisa analisa as informações sobre subsídios durante a pandemia da covid-19, desde o comunicado de imprensa do governo indonésio até as notícias da mídia de massa. Os subsídios de informações são uma prática interessante a ser estudada, pois descrevem como as informações fluem na sociedade. Essa prática se torna inevitável, especialmente durante a pandemia, o que implica restrições às atividades e distanciamento social. Esta pesquisa utilizou análise de enquadramento e métodos quantitativos. Os resultados indicaram práticas de subsídios de informação com um total de 95.65% das amostras de comunicados de imprensa do governo indonésio publicados pela mídia de massa na forma de notícias no mesmo período. A análise não mostrou diferença significativa entre as informações dos comunicados de imprensa do governo e as notícias no site detik.com por meio da análise do enquadramento dominante, enquadramento episódico e temático, apelo emocional, enquadramento de ganho-perda, notícias de origem e tom das notícias. Teme-se que a prática de subsídios de informação leve à degeneração da responsabilidade social da mídia de massa e elimine o processo de verificação de dados no jornalismo.

Palavras-chave: Análise de enquadramento. Notícias. Comunicado à imprensa. Informações sobre subsídios.

PRÁCTICA DE SUBSIDIO DE LA INFORMACIÓN DURANTE LA PANDEMIA: un caso en el periodismo Indonesio

RESUMEN – Esta investigación analiza la información subvencionada durante la pandemia de covid-19, desde el comunicado de prensa del Gobierno indonesio hasta las noticias de los medios de comunicación. Las subvenciones a la información son una práctica interesante de estudiar, ya que describen cómo fluye la información en la sociedad. Esta práctica se hace inevitable, especialmente durante la pandemia, lo que implica restricciones en las actividades y distanciamiento social. Esta investigación utilizó análisis de encuadre y métodos cuantitativos. Los resultados indicaron prácticas de subvención de la información con un total del 95.65% de las muestras de comunicados de prensa del gobierno indonesio publicados por los medios de comunicación en forma de noticias en el mismo periodo. El análisis no mostró diferencias significativas entre la información de los comunicados de prensa del gobierno y las noticias de detik.com mediante el análisis del encuadre dominante, el encuadre episódico y temático, el atractivo emocional, el encuadre de ganancia-pérdida, las noticias de origen y el tono de las noticias. Se teme que la práctica de las subvenciones a la información provoque la degeneración de la responsabilidad social de los medios de comunicación y elimine el proceso de verificación de datos en el periodismo.

Palabras clave: Análisis del encuadre. Noticias. Comunicado de prensa. Información sobre subvenciones.

1 Introduction

Since the end of 2019, the covid-19 pandemic has exacerbated conditions in various countries that eventually led to crises in social, economic, political, and media systems (Casero-Ripollés, 2020). On March 31, 2020, the Government of Indonesia officially announced a health crisis or emergency (Ramadhani, 2020). The Indonesian Government implemented a physical distancing policy that limited activities in the community, instead of enforcing full lockdown.

The Indonesian government's policies in response to the covid-19 pandemic were criticized by the public. The government claimed that the virus would not enter Indonesia, that tourism would increase, that airlines would give significant ticket discounts, and more (Nugroho, 2020). From a community standpoint, the suggestion for physical distancing to prevent the spread of covid-19, also recommended by World Health Organization (WHO), was still carried out correctly. This policy was implemented on March 31, 2020, but was deemed constrained given the disciplined attitude of the public (Badan Pusat Statistik, 2020).

Regarding information dissemination, the Indonesian Government created a web portal, www.covid19.go.id, as the sole information portal. Centralized information can be used to control the spread of misinformation in society (Brainard & Hunter, 2020). From January 1 to April 15, 2020, 534 fake news articles (mainly text, images, and videos on social media) were circulated (Angeline et al., 2020). The fake news was spread on social media, ranging from misinformation regarding the handling of covid-19 to information on the use of masks that do not follow health standards.

The crisis has changed the consumption of information, one change being how information has become a primary need in society. In this case, the mass media is an essential source of information for the public in dealing with covid-19. Previous research has stated that the covid-19 crisis was an era of connecting society with news as an awakening of the role of media (Casero-Ripollés, 2020).

The media ecosystem in Indonesia is shaped by capital interests that lead to media oligopoly. Previous research states that the development of digital media has led to information overload. Hence, people in Indonesia need to realize that they have lost their right to get reliable information (Sukmayadi, 2019).

This research compares the practice of information subsidization represented by the flow of information from the Government through its official channel, www.covid19.go.id, with the news in the detik.com mass media. Detik.com was chosen as it is one of Alexa's Top Site versions, which has 32.598 links and an estimated 4.23 daily page views per visitor (Alexa, 2021). Detik.com is one of Indonesia's most prominent private media companies and has been active since May 1998. It has become a pioneer of digital media in Indonesia and is owned by CT Corp (Tapsell, 2017).

Based on the description above, this research proposes the following question: how is the practice of information subsidy

from the Indonesian Government to detik.com media amid the covid-19 Pandemic?

2 Literature review

2.1 Crisis in the covid-19 pandemic

Various sectors of life have experienced problems since the emergence of covid-19. In the education sector, the Indonesian Government launched Study from Home, which, in other studies, has led to technical and communication problems (Hidayat et al., 2020). The economic sector is deemed a central sector that requires preparation in the face of a pandemic. This is due to the fear of recession, which may imply higher death rates (Michie, 2020).

Additionally, shocks to mental health are also an unavoidable issue. The covid-19 pandemic is a worldwide emergency with psychological, social, and economic consequences. Previous studies show that different perceptions of the severity of covid-19 on health were influenced by psychosocial factors, especially feelings of difficulty and loneliness (Cerami et al., 2020). Furthermore, adverse emotional conditions, individual perceptions, imitating behavior, and social-psychological factors could also lead to panic (Yuen et al., 2020).

Handling covid-19 requires government support in six ways, one of which is information management to handle the crisis by disseminating public information to citizens (Meijer & Webster, 2020). From a public relations perspective, mass media is a party that needs to be embraced when handling crises. A study in Italy found that, between February and March 2020, the Corriere Della Sera newspaper reported little on covid-19 mortality cases. This was an attempt not to instill terror in the community to avoid moral panic, which reduced community preventive behavior during the pandemic (Solomon et al., 2021).

On the other hand, mass media has three functions in terms of handling pandemic situations (Wilkins, 2005). First, it provides information about the disease. Second, through action, (i.e., reporting the current situation to the community) it can help the authorities in decision-making. The third function is monitoring how the pandemic is being handled. Furthermore, Willkins explains that this third function is achieved by criticizing policies, acting like a kind

of mitigation supervisor, in order to handle the pandemic correctly. Media reports that oppose efforts to handle the covid-19 pandemic may lead to various harmful actions, for example, panic buying due to information about the scarcity of certain products in the United States (Arafat et al., 2020).

2.2 Information subsidy

Public relations practitioners often assist the mass media in determining daily coverage (Cameron et al., 1997). This is because the interaction between news sources and journalists is arranged as a relationship between public relations practitioners and clients. Previous research suggests that, from a journalist's perspective, good relations with other parties are essential (Sallot & Johnson, 2006).

The process of determining news is called the practice of information subsidy. In the view of the political economy of the media, the phenomenon of information subsidy is motivated by the position of the media as an industry. The mass media is interested in obtaining as much profit as possible, which can affect the content being produced (Forde & Johnston, 2013). One of the criticisms of the media industry is the change in its focus, which is more concerned with profit than social responsibility (Curtin, 2009).

Information subsidy is part of a competitive market that benefits both parties: the media and news sources (Curtin, 2009). In addition to attention from news sources, news sourced from information subsidies is cheap. News that gets its sources from public relations is considered a cost-effective practice (Boumans, 2018). On the other hand, the media plays an important role in shaping the circulation of information in society (Boumans, 2018). Information subsidy is a practice that occurs in two areas of media organizations: business and journalism (Curtin, 2009).

Gandy uses the term information subsidy to describe access control and information materials to minimize costs to the mass media (Gandy, 1980). Reporters who seek information independently are not included in the information subsidy.

Information subsidies include providing access to information about places and news sources (Sweetser & Brown, 2008). In some cases, information subsidy by the Government may not be directly quoted. So, this study considered the job position of the information

sources, primary sources, and the number of source citations. Previous research indicates that journalists modified the information given by information sources in various ways (Maat & De Jong, 2013), for instance, verifying the opposing sources of information or even neglecting the main news sources.

The researchers in this study refer to the information subsidy offered by public relations through press releases. This is based on the assumption that press releases are one of the sources of news for journalists who are considered important (Jackson, 2019). On the other hand, if the mass media report is the same as the press release, then the organization's image will be positive (Mansur & Harsono, 2020).

The press release is information from public relations recommended as analytical material to describe agenda-building through information subsidy (Kiousis et al., 2009). Gandy asserts that press releases as a routine channel are an economical source of information for journalists (Gandy, 1980). Agenda building is carried out by promoting problem definition, cause and effect interpretation, moral evaluation, and recommendations of events (Jackson, 2019). In developing the agenda, the mass media acts as a distributor, facilitator, mediator, and political actor.

Previous research has shown that timing in press releases plays a significant role in whether journalists decide to use them as news sources or not (Ketelaars & Sevenans, 2020). Based on authority and credibility, the Government is one of the significant news sources for journalists. However, in news production, journalists must adhere to the rules of journalism, such as covering both sides of a story, verifying data, and being objective (Kovach & Rosenstiels, 2007).

In general, the mass media's use of information from public relations practitioners is not a violation of journalism's code of ethics. The stages of the news production process, such as data verification, are focused on reproducing the information frame and then verifying it using other sources.

In terms of handling the crisis, the media can become a public relations partner of the Government if, of course, the relationship between the two parties is fair. If one party has more control than the other, it will limit the other party's authority (Veil & Ojeda, 2010). The mass media needs to carry out its duty, which is reporting the facts.

The process of producing news in the mass media will determine the quality of information distributed to the public. In this case, journalistic work is required to be responsive to provide

credible and updated information. Information subsidy is a concept where public relations actively provides information as news material. Information subsidy occurs in various countries such as Australia (Sherwood & Nicholson, 2017), Germany (Obermaier et al., 2018), and Singapore (Lee & Basnyat, 2013).

In a democracy, a healthy and independent flow of information is needed so that people can choose the information they need (Boumans, 2018). However, problems develop when the message production process from the mass media is not independent and produces an abundant amount of information from public relations, resulting in media content that does not serve the community's interests (Davis, 2000).

Previous research suggests that news that does not follow real events, and actually strengthens information uncertainty during a pandemic (Papapicco, 2020). Consumption of and trust in the news can be challenging because it can create negative opinions that compromise public health efforts, particularly during the covid-19 pandemic (Dhanani & Franz, 2020).

2.3 Journalism and public relations

The relationship between journalism and public relations is an interdependent one (Raphael Ojebuyi & Francis Adekoya, 2020). Both work together in the realm of information and serve the community. Mass media reporting is the primary channel for disseminating information and forming public opinion. This condition is a substantial goal in public relations (Larsson, 2009). Public relations practitioners often share information to gain publicity in the mass media.

One difference between information for journalists and information public relations practitioners lies in purpose and type (Maat & De Jong, 2013). In this case, journalists are more likely to hold a neutral position and avoid self-promotion, which is not the case in news products from public relations practitioners. A previous study claims that journalists played an essential role during the avian influenza outbreak in Australia as they had to be alert to the development of fundamental and technical information regarding the outbreak (Hooker et al., 2012). The media can also be used as a source of accurate and educational information for the public, and they also act as watchdogs for government policies (Aliansi Jurnalis

Independen, 2020).

Another difference relates to the relationship between closeness and independence. In this case, public relations practitioners are eager to build an intense relationship with journalists. Research in China has shown that the main priority of public relations is to influence news reports (Cheng et al., 2016). Meanwhile, journalism is a profession that upholds autonomy and independence in carrying out its duties as the fourth pillar (Graber, 2003). Ideally, the news production process should be independent, interact directly with information sources, and require direct observation from journalists (Tenenboim-Weinblatt & Baden, 2018).

3 Framing analysis

Framing in this study refers to social frameworks as classified by Erving Goffman. Social frameworks provide an understanding of events that incorporate the will, aim, and controlling effort of an intelligence, a live agency (Goffman, 1986).

Robert Entman explains that framing analysis consists of four elements when analyzing the framing of an event: the communicator, the message, the recipient, and the cultural setting (Entman, 1993). The analysis used in this research focuses on the message as a communicator. Framing is a process that involves elements of selection and salience (Entman, 1993). In other words, framing selects an aspect of reality to make it more prominent. Framing reflects the judgments made by the communicator or message sender (Hallahan, 1999).

From a journalist's perspective, framing also emphasizes how journalists manage information due to their interaction with information sources. Journalist assessment includes rationality, expertise, public support, bias toward certain groups, power, and professional ideology (Reese, 2008). This causes public relations practitioners to try various ways to convince journalists of the information they provide.

Various studies have used framing analysis to analyze information subdivisions in times of crisis, such as the H1N1 crisis in Singapore (Lee & Basnyat, 2013) and the Malaysia Airlines Flight 370 disappearance (Shiang et al., 2020).

In this study, the framing of the text will be divided into the following categories: comparing the main ideas between the Indonesian

government press releases and the news on detik.com, comparing the characteristics of the news themes between the Indonesian government press releases and the news on detik.com, comparing the emotions expressed by Indonesian government press releases and news on detik.com, comparing the framing of loss and gain between Indonesian government press releases and news on detik.com, comparing the use of news sources between Indonesian government press releases and news on detik.com, and comparing news tone between Indonesian government press release with news on detik.com.

4 Methodology

This research is quantitative and applies a content analysis method. Content analysis was used to analyze press releases and news published by detik.com. The unit analyzed in this study is the thematic unit. The thematic unit allows the researcher to look at the tendency of a text (Holsti, 1969). Data were taken between March and September 2020.

The research object in this study consisted of 1.134 press releases. The probability sampling technique of simple random sampling was calculated using the Slovin formula, obtaining 92 press release samples with a margin of error of 10%.

The sample from detik.com was taken based on the 92 press releases. Meanwhile, the reliability test was conducted through an intercoder using the Holsti formula with a result of 0.89 or 89%. Furthermore, cross-tabulation and t-tests through SPSS were utilized in this study to compare the differences between press release framing and reporting. When examining the similarity of texts between press releases and news reports, this research used elements of framing analysis from both texts. This study involved seven framing categories to observe how the practice of information subsidies occurs (Lee & Basnyat, 2013). The seven categories are described in table 1 below:

Table 1*Research categories*

Category	Type	Definition
Dominant frame	Basic information	Factual information or updates on covid-19 in terms of numbers of fatalities, confirmed cases, or WHO actions.
	Preventive information	Good behaviors preventing the spread of covid-19 including hand washing and temperature measurement.
	Treatment information	Treatment options include what to do and where to go.
	Medical research	New medical findings, e.g., vaccine efficacy or virus mutations.
	Social context	Position of covid-19 in a societal context, e.g., impact on social activities.
	Economic context	Position of covid-19 in an economic context, e.g., tourism.
	Political context	Position of covid-19 in a political context, e.g., diplomatic ties.
	Personal stories	Experiences of patients/families.
	Others	
Episodic & thematic framing	Episodic	Focus on: (1) the issue; (2) trends over time; (3) the public realm – the environment and public institutions; (4) how to fix the conditions that led to the problem; (5) addressing the audience as citizens or stakeholders who have an active role in problem-solving; (6) finding solutions through better policies; (7) broader social and institutional responsibilities for problems.
	Thematic	Focus on: (1) the individual; (2) a single event; (3) the private realm (an individual's psychology or behaviors within a family); (4) how to fix the person experiencing the problem; (5) addressing the audience as consumers; (6) finding solutions to problems through better information; (7) individual responsibilities for problems.

Emotional appeal	Fear	An expression of agitation or anxiety caused by the presence of danger.
	Anger	An expression of displeasure or hostility.
	Satisfaction	An expression of gratification of a need, achievement of a goal, or overcoming an adversity.
	Sadness	An expression of sorrow or unhappiness.
	Reassurance	An expression of restored confidence.
Gain-Loss frames	Gain frame	Focusing on the gains that resulted from the pandemic or response efforts.
	Loss frame	Focusing on the losses that resulted from the pandemic or response efforts.
	Neutral	No judgment.
Sourcing news	Government officials	
	Corporate official	
	Victim/ family member	
	Other organizations	
News tone	Positive tone	Positive feelings toward the Government's efforts.
	Negative tone	Negative feelings toward the Government's efforts.
	Neutral tone	No judgment.

5 Presentation and analysis of findings

The analysis in this study was conducted by understanding the framing of government press releases and then comparing them with news from detik.com. 92 press releases were then searched through the detik.com news index.

In this study, 88 of the 92 press release research samples matched with news from detik.com. However, four press releases were not found in any posts on detik.com. The results showed that detik.com mass media reported most of the government's press release information. This is evidenced by the 88 reports on 92 press releases found on detik.com. Press releases become a source of news that can influence the choice of news angles, which accept most of the information used in press releases as fact.

5.1 Dominant frame

In the central idea dimension (dominant frame), the highest frequency value (Yes = 1) was found in the social context of the detik.com group as much as 43 times and the Government as much as 44 times. Then, the frequency of the value (Yes= 1) was found in preventive information; 31 times (17.8%) in the detik.com group and 32 times (18.4%) in the government.

Table 2

Comparison Results of Chi-square Test for Dominant Frame Category

Dominant Frame	Group				Sig	χ
	news (detik.com)		government			
	No	Yes	No	Yes		
Basic information	68 (39.1%)	19 (10.9%)	72 (41.4%)	15 (8.6%)	0.444	0.585
Preventive information	56 (32.2%)	31 (17.8%)	55 (31.6%)	32 (18.4%)	0.875	0.025
Treatment information	79 (45.4%)	8 (4.6%)	80 (46%)	7 (4%)	0.787	0.073
Medical research	82 (47.1%)	5 (2.9%)	83 (47.7%)	4 (2.3%)	0.732	0.116
Social context	44 (25.3%)	43 (24.7%)	43 (24.7%)	44 (25.3%)	0.879	0.023
Economic context	62 (35.6%)	25 (14.4%)	63 (36.2%)	24 (13.8%)	0.866	0.028

The table above shows the chi-square test results for the relationship between social context themes in press releases and news on detik.com. The results show that 0 cells (0.0%) have an expected count of less than 5. This implies that the test results do not violate the assumptions in this study, which is more than 5. The value of 0.00 is smaller than the alpha value of 0.005, so it can be determined that the results are significant. In other words, the overall chi-square test results showed no difference in frequency between the two groups. Each comparison of the texts shows that the press release text remained the same as the detik.com news text.

The Indonesian government and detik.com often favor social context as the most frequent theme. Meanwhile, Medical Research is

the theme that appeared the least, with a frequency of 2.9% on detik.com and 2.3% on the government. This shows that the government and detik.com need to be more concerned about using medical research-based information to educate the public on covid-19. This could, however, be a result of a lack of medical research on covid-19.

5.2 Thematic and episodic frames

The category of episodic and thematic themes showed the highest frequency finding in the value (Yes = 1), which was found in Episodic in detik.com Group 61 times (35.1%) and government 59 times (33.9%). The overall chi-square test results showed no difference in frequency between the two groups.

Table 3

Comparison of Chi-Square Test for Framing Category

Framing	Group				Sig	χ
	detik.com		government			
	No	Yes	No	Yes		
Episodic	26 (14.9%)	61 (35.1%)	28 (16.1%)	59 (33.9%)	0.743	0.107
Thematic	56 (32.2%)	31 (17.8%)	56 (32.2%)	31 (17.8%)	-	-

5.3 Emotional appeal

In the emotional appeal category, the press release text focused more on the emotional appeal of fear by 36 (31.58%), followed by the emotional appeal of reassurance by 30 (26.32%), and satisfaction, anger, neutral, and sadness, consecutively. The emotional appeal of the news mainly remained the same. The news on detik.com was dominated by the emotional appeal of fear 42 times (24.1%). The overall chi-square test results showed no difference in frequency between the two groups.

Table 4*Results of Comparison of Chi-square Test for Emotional Appeal Category*

Emotional Appeal	Group				Sig	χ
	news (detik.com)		government			
	No	Yes	No	Yes		
Fear	45 (29.5%)	42 (24.1%)	51 (29.3%)	36 (20.7%)	0.360	0.837
Anger	80 (46%)	7 (4%)	77 (44.3%)	10 (5.7%)	0.444	0.587
Satisfaction	69 (39.7%)	18 (10.3%)	66 (37.9%)	21 (12.1%)	0.585	0.297
Sadness	83 (47.7%)	4 (2.3%)	80 (46%)	7 (4%)	0.350	0.873
Reassurance	63 (36.2%)	24 (13.8%)	57 (32.8%)	30 (17.2%)	0.326	0.967
Neutral	74 (42.5%)	13 (7.5%)	77 (44.3%)	10 (5.7%)	0.502	0.451

5.4 Gain-Loss Framing

Through press releases, the government is more likely to respond to the covid-19 pandemic as a loss than as an advantage. In the Gain Loss Frame dimension, the highest frequency in the value (Yes = 1) was found in the Loss Frame in the detik.com group as much as 51 times (29.3%) and the government as much as 51 times (29.3%). The overall chi-square test results showed that there was no difference in frequency between the two groups.

Table 5

Chi-square Test Comparison Results for Gain Loss Frame Category

Gain Loss Frame	Group				Sig	χ
	news (detik.com)		(government)			
	No	Yes	No	Yes		
Gain Frame	84 (48.3%)	3 (1.7%)	84 (48.3%)	3 (1.7%)	-	-
Loss Frame	36 (20.7%)	51 (29.3%)	36 (20.7%)	51 (29.3%)	-	-
Neutral	56 (32.2%)	31 (17.8%)	56 (32.2%)	31 (17.8%)	-	-

Loss frame perspectives dominated both press releases and detik.com. The analysis results show that the perspective of the gain-loss frame created by the government is identical news. For example, in a press release entitled ‘MUI Invites Muslims to Learn Wisdom from the covid-19 Pandemic as Blessing’ dated April 13, 2020, and a report by detik.com entitled ‘Corona Outbreak: Learn Wisdom through Worship in Tranquility’ also dated April 13, 2020. Both news reports attempted to depict the covid-19 pandemic as a gain perspective in that a situation like this can teach lessons.

5.5 Sourcing news

In using sources in press releases, the highest frequency was dominated by Indonesian government sources. The frequency of the detik.com group was 78 times (44.8%), and the government group was also 78 times (44.8%).

In this case, the government, as a news source, included the president and his staff, regional heads, and the covid-19 Task Force. Meanwhile, other organizations as a source of news included MAFINDO (Masyarakat Anti Fitnah Indonesia) as Anti Hoax Community and Indonesian Ulema Council Ulama Indonesia. Other sources included in the non-organizational category were Indonesian celebrities, such as musician Sam Bimbo. The overall chi-square test results showed no difference in frequency between the two groups.

Table 6*Comparison Results of Chi-square Test for Sourcing News Category*

Sourcing News	Group				Sig	χ
	news (detik.com)		(government)			
	No	Yes	No	Yes		
Indonesian Government	9 (5.2%)	78 (44.8%)	9 (5.2%)	78 (44.8%)	-	-
Local Government	86 (49.4%)	1 (0.6%)	86 (49.4%)	1 (0.6%)	-	-
Corporates	87	-	87	-	-	-
Victim / Family of victim	87	-	87	-	-	-
Other organization	80 (46%)	7 (4%)	80 (46%)	7 (4%)	-	-
Non-Organization	84 (48.3%)	3 (1.7%)	84 (48.3%)	3 (1.7%)	-	-
Health experts	86 (49.4%)	1 (0.6%)	86 (49.4%)	1 (0.6%)	-	-

5.6 News tone

In the press release, various government efforts and responses are presented in a positive tone. The highest frequency is found in the positive tone. In the detik.com group, positive tones are presented 61 times (35.1%) and in the government press release positive tones are presented 70 times (40.2%). The overall chi-square test results showed no difference in frequency between the two groups.

Table 7
Comparison Results of Chi-Square Test for News Tone Category

News tone	Group				Sig	χ
	news (detik.com)		(government)			
	No	Yes	No	Yes		
Positive tone	26 (14.9%)	61 (35.1%)	17 (9.8%)	70 (40.2%)	0.114	2.502
Negative tone	87	-	87	-	-	-
Neutral tone	61 (35.1%)	26 (14.9%)	70 (40.2%)	17 (9.8%)	0.114	2.502

These results show that press releases and news coverage were both dominated by positive tones. However, the distribution was slightly different from positive to neutral tones. For example, in the news report entitled ‘President Warns Regions to Continue to Control the Spread of covid-19’. The report contains this excerpt:

At the end of his speech, the President applauded the Central Kalimantan Provincial Government for conducting massive tests. However, it still needs to be improved, and the regions should be asked to synergize with elements of the Commander-in-chief and Regional Chief of Police to carry out aggressive tracking and always invite the community to apply health protocols. The Government’s duties are to conduct massive testing, aggressive tracking, and enforce strict isolation. It is the public’s obligation that we must remember: wear masks everywhere, keep your distance, and avoid crowds. “We should continuously remember this; it cannot stop. Be careful, 1,093 positive cases must be stopped, so there are no more other cases”, he expressed. (News Detik.com)

However, the news reports on detik.com did not use the quote to present a positive image of the government’s efforts. Detik.com only quoted Jokowi’s warning that this virus cannot be taken lightly. This indicates a change in tone from press releases to news.

6 Discussion

The research results show that the news text on detik.com and the press release from the Indonesian government in the six framing categories examined in this study are similar. The mass media is dependent on providing information about covid-19,

especially on the theme, framing, gain-loss framing, news source, and news tone aspects. Changes in the category of emotional appeal can be seen in the press release entitled 'These are the Rules for Boarding Commercial Airplanes during PSBB' dated May 21, 2020, which focuses on the rules for prospective commercial airplane passengers. The press release report was titled 'Corona Test Results Expired, Do not Expect to Board a Plane'. This change indicates a change in news writing as the emotional words it uses change from neutral to fear.

In crisis management, emotional appeal can influence a community when dealing with the pandemic. Specifically, shared emotions of anger and danger can shape compliance measures and assist communities in accepting mitigation strategies such as wearing masks and physical distancing (Malecki et al., 2021).

The government's practice of information subsidy influences most news with the same theme, framing, gain-loss framing, news source, and news tone. Previous research even referred to this condition as an editorial subsidy, which is the development of an information subsidy by providing ready-to-publish information, the format of which has been adapted to the mass media format and contains the message of the primary client (Jackson & Moloney, 2016).

Furthermore, this condition represents a stage of journalism called data verification, which the mass media ignores. This neglect is intentional and occurs for several reasons, such as pressure for journalists to produce news reports in print and other formats, which causes a lack of balancing efforts and cross-checking data from different sides (Tiffen et al., 2014). Ideally, in a democratic climate, the media speak for the people, represent their interests, and function as a government watchdog to ensure good governance (Ashraf, 2014).

Indeed, journalists can reframe information from public relations in two ways (Maat & De Jong, 2013). The first is by re-contextualizing and adding sources of information, particularly to the government's handling of covid-19. Given the large amount of infodemic information and misinformation circulating in the community, accurate information from the government is an option in the news.

News sources are the main feature in mass media news reports. Information sources who approach journalists and supply information play an essential role both for the media and the news source's interests. The limited resources of media organizations

welcome the information from these sources, making this dependency relationship even closer (Badham, 2019). Another study examining the correlation between the financial health of media organizations, online media work rhythms, and information subsidy confirmed a significant relationship between the financial resources of media companies and the diversity of information (Jung Moon & Hyun, 2014).

Another finding is that, in response to the covid-19 pandemic, neither the government nor detik.com included victims' families as a source of information. Community participation is important in government communication. Another study states that the local government in Banjarmasin, South Kalimantan, has yet to fully involve the community in implementing government communications amid the covid-19 pandemic (Ahmad & Murad, 2020). However, this is also related to the media's limitations in reaching the public, given the conditions of the physical distancing policy implemented by the government. In this case, the media is expected to use digital media (for example, social media) as a source of information that can reach the community.

The government information sources in this study include the president and state officials, the covid-19 Task Force, local governments, and other government agencies. This research shows that the press release by the government values reporting by providing a trusted source in the health sector (the covid-19 Task Force), which is composed of many professionals, including doctors. This aligns with other studies suggesting doctors are considered a trusted source for health problems (Leask et al., 2010).

This required detik.com media to verify the information from the press release. Previous research stated that journalism in South Africa that uses press releases but does not use other sources is viewed as trying to bypass the role of media investigation (Heyl et al., 2020). The media can be considered a passive bridge because it only plays a role as a carrier of information from a dominant source.

However, this condition is inseparable from the ongoing covid-19 pandemic crisis. In a pandemic, public panic is a problem that needs to be addressed by the government and the mass media as a source of information. This is related to the psychological condition of the public who are overwhelmed by feelings of uncertainty, mass fear, and other emotions, so information from both press releases and mass media should be able to help people manage their emotions (Lee & Basnyat, 2013). In addition, there is a possibility that journalists see themselves as a kind of public health agent.

The legacy of the pandemic in Australia, which highlights the sensitivity of journalists in understanding conflicts of interest between scientists and policymakers regarding public health issues, must continue to be noted for improvement (Holland et al., 2014). The mass media's adherence to political actors is also feared as a dependency relationship (Falasca, 2014). It is recommended that the media in Indonesia reach out to sources of information from the scientific side, especially public health. The goal of educating the public on covid-19 needs to be harmonized between the media, the government, and society.

7 Conclusion

The Indonesian government is a vital source of information in the mass media, especially during a crisis. However, there is a need for discipline in the journalistic process, which prioritizes data verification processes and increases awareness among journalists to provide appropriate and valuable information to the public.

The mass media needs to strengthen its position as a bridge between the government and society, but that does not mean it should be an extension of the government itself. However, the conditions of the covid-19 pandemic are also an example of how limited activities in Indonesia significantly affect how news is produced. As a result, media companies need to respond quickly to these conditions, for example, by using technology. This information subsidy process also needs more digital literacy, especially in the use of technology. The mass media needs to adapt to technological developments and be aware of health communication issues.

The text analysis method used in this study does have limitations. Future research should use qualitative methods to analyze the points of view of journalists, editors, and mass media editors in the news production process during the pandemic. Finally, improvements, especially the partnership between the mass media and the Government public relations, need to be made through this research. The quality of information is an important tool for the community to face the covid-19 pandemic.

REFERENCES

Ahmad, A. R., & Murad, H. R. (2020). The impact of social media on panic during the COVID-19 pandemic in Iraqi Kurdistan: online questionnaire study. *Journal of medical Internet research*, 22(5), e19556.

Alexa. (n.d). *Learn more about Alexa features, skills, and products*. Retrieved from www.alex.com/topsites/countries/ID

Aliansi Jurnalis Independen. (2020). *Protokol Keamanan Liputan & Pemberitaan COVID-19*.

Angeline, M., Safitri, Y., & Luthfia, A. (2020). Can the Damage be Undone? Analyzing Misinformation during covid-19 Outbreak in Indonesia. *Proceedings of 2020 International Conference on Information Management and Technology (ICIMTech)*. DOI: 10.1109/ICIMTech50083.2020.9211124

Arafat, S. M. Y., Kar, S. K., Menon, V., Kaliamoorthy, C., Mukherjee, S., Alradie-Mohamed, A., Sharma, P., Marthoenis, M., & Kabir, R. (2020). Panic Buying: An Insight from the Content Analysis of Media Reports during COVID-19 Pandemic. *Neurology Psychiatry and Brain Research*, 37, 100–103. DOI: 10.1016/j.npbr.2020.07.002

Ashraf, P. (2014). The Role of Media in Good Governance: Paid News Culture of Media and the Challenges to Indian Democracy. *International Research Journal of Social Sciences*, 3(3), 41–43. Retrieved from www.isca.me/IJSS/Archive/v3/i3/8.ISCA-IRJSS-2014-20.php

Badan Pusat Statistik. (2020). *Hasil Survei Sosial Demorafi Dampak Covid-19 2020*. Badan Pusat Statistik.

Badham, M. (2019). Four news media roles shaping agenda-building processes. In *Big ideas in public relations research and practice* (pp. 163-176). Emerald Publishing Limited.

Boumans, J. (2018). Subsidizing The News?: Organizational Press Releases' Influence on News Media's Agenda and Content. *Journalism Studies*, 19(15), 2264–2282. DOI: 10.1080/1461670X.2017.1338154

Brainard, J., & Hunter, P. R. (2020). Misinformation making a Disease Outbreak Worse: Outcomes Compared for Influenza, Monkeypox, and Norovirus. *Simulation*, 96(4), 365–374. DOI: 10.1177/0037549719885021

Cameron, G. T., Sallot, L. M., & Curtin, P. A. (1997). Public Relations and the Production of News: A Critical Review and Theoretical Framework. *Proceedings of the International Communication Association*. DOI: 10.1080/23808985.1997.11678940

Casero-Ripollés, A. (2020). Impact of Covid-19 on the Media System. Communicative and Democratic Consequences of News Consumption during the Outbreak. *Profesional de La Informacion*, 29(2), 1–11. DOI: 10.3145/epi.2020.Mar.23

Cerami, C., Santi, G. C., Galandra, C., Dodich, A., Cappa, S. F., Vecchi, T., & Crespi, C. (2020). Covid-19 Outbreak In Italy: Are We Ready for the Psychosocial and the Economic Crisis? Baseline Findings From the PsyCovid Study. *Frontiers in Psychiatry*, 11, 1–9. DOI: 10.3389/fpsyt.2020.00556

Cheng, Y., Huang, Y. H. C., & Chan, C. M. (2016). Public Relations, Media Coverage, and Public Opinion in Contemporary China: Testing Agenda Building Theory in a Social Mediated Crisis. *Telematics and Informatics*, 34(3), 765–773. DOI: 10.1016/j.tele.2016.05.012

Curtin, P. A. (2009). Reevaluating Public Relations Information Subsidies: Market-Driven Journalism and Agenda-Building Theory and Practice. *Journal of Public Relations Research*, 11(1), 53–90. DOI: 10.1207/s1532754xjpr1101

Davis, A. (2000). Public Relations, News Production and Changing Patterns of Source Access in the British National Media. *Media, Culture & Society*, 22, 39–59. DOI: 10.1177/016344300022001003

Dhanani, L. Y., & Franz, B. (2020). The Role of News Consumption and Trust in Public Health Leadership in Shaping COVID-19 Knowledge and Prejudice. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 11, 1–13. DOI: 10.3389/fpsyg.2020.560828

Entman, R. M. (1993). Framing: Toward Clarification of a Fractured Paradigm. *Journal of Communication*, 43(4), 51–58. DOI: 10.1111/j.1460-2466.1993.tb01304.x

Falasca, K. (2014). Framing the Financial Crisis: An Unexpected Interaction between the Government and the Press. *Observatorio*, 8(1), 1–21. DOI: 10.15847/obsOBS812014752

Forde, S., & Johnston, J. (2013). THE NEWS TRIUMVIRATE: Public Relations, Wire Agencies and Online Copy. *Journalism Studies*, 14(1), 113–129. DOI: 10.1080/1461670X.2012.679859

Gandy, O. H. (1980). Information in health: Subsidised news. *Media, Culture & Society*, 2(2), 103–115. DOI: 10.1177/016344378000200201

Goffman, E. (1986). *Frame Analysis: An Essay on the Organization of Experience*. Northern University Press.

Graber, D. (2003). The Media and Democracy: Beyond Myths and Stereotypes. *Annual Review of Political Science*, 6, 139–160. DOI: 10.1146/annurev.polisci.6.121901.085707

Hallahan, K. (1999). Seven Models of Framing: Implications for Public Relations. *International Journal of Phytoremediation*, 21(1), 205–242. DOI: 10.1207/s1532754xjpr1103_02

Hidayat, D., Anisti, P., & Wibawa, D. (2020). Crisis Management and Communication Experience in Education during the Covid-19 Pandemic in Indonesia. *Jurnal Komunikasi: Malaysian Journal of Communication*, 36(3), 67–82. DOI: 10.17576/JKMJC-2020-3603-05

Heyl, A., Joubert, M., & Guenther, L. (2020). Churnalism and hype in science communication: Comparing university press releases and journalistic articles in South Africa. *Communicatio: South African Journal of Communication Theory and Research*, 46(2), 126-145.

Holland, K., Sweet, M., Blood, R. W., & Fogarty, A. (2014). A Legacy of the Swine Flu Global Pandemic: Journalists, Expert Sources, and Conflicts of Interest. *Journalism*, 15(1), 53–71. DOI: 10.1177/1464884913480460

Holsti, O. (1969). *Content Analysis for the Social Sciences and Humanities*. Addison Wesley.

Hooker, C., King, C., & Leask, J. (2012). Journalists' Views about Reporting Avian Influenza and a Potential Pandemic: A Qualitative Study. *Influenza and Other Respiratory Viruses*, 6(3), 224–229. DOI: 10.1111/j.1750-2659.2011.00319.x

Jackson, D. (2019). Press Releases/News Releases/ VNRs. *The International Encyclopedia of Journalism Studies*, 1–5. DOI: 10.1002/9781118841570.iejs0266

Jackson, D., & Moloney, K. (2016). Inside Churnalism: PR, Journalism and Power Relationships in Flux. *Journalism Studies*, 17(6), 763–780. DOI: 10.1080/1461670X.2015.1017597

Jung Moon, S., & Hyun, K. D. (2014). Online Media Relations as an Information Subsidy: Quality of Fortune 500 Companies' Websites and Relationships to Media Salience. *Mass communication and society*, 17(2), 258-273.

Ketelaars, P., & Sevenans, J. (2020). It's a Matter of Timing. How the Timing of Politicians' Information Subsidies Affects What Becomes News. *Political Communication*, 00(00), 1–21. DOI: 10.1080/10584609.2020.1763528

Kiousis, S., Kim, S., Mcdevitt, M., & Ostrowski, A. (2009). Competing for Attention: Information Subsidy Influence in Agenda Building During Election Campaign. *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly*, 86(3), 545–562. DOI: 10.1177/107769900908600306

Kovach, B., & Rosenstiel, T. (2007). *The Elements of Journalism What Newspeople Should Know and the Public Should Expect*. Crown Publisher.

Larsson, L. (2009). PR and the Media. *Nordicom Review*, 30(1), 131–147. DOI: 10.1515/nor-2017-0143

Leask, J., Hooker, C., & King, C. (2010). Media coverage of health issues and how to work more effectively with journalists: a qualitative study. *BMC public health*, 10, 1-7.

Lee, S. T., & Basnyat, I. (2013). From Press Release to News: Mapping the Framing of the 2009 H1N1 A Influenza Pandemic. *Health Communication*, 28(2), 119–132. DOI: 10.1080/10410236.2012.658550

Maat, H. P., & De Jong, C. (2013). How Newspaper Journalists Reframe Product Press Release Information. *Journalism*, 14(3), 348–371. DOI: 10.1177/1464884912448914

Malecki, K. M. C., Keating, J. A., & Safdar, N. (2021). Crisis Communication and Public Perception of COVID-19 Risk in the Era of Social Media. *Clinical Infectious Diseases: An Official Publication of the Infectious Diseases Society of America*, 72(4), 697–702. DOI: 10.1093/cid/ciaa758

Mansur, S., & Harsono, S. A. (2020). Press Release by Medco E&P Malaka on Serambi Indonesia Online News Coverage. *Jurnal The Messenger*, 12(1), 14. DOI: 10.26623/themessenger.v12i1.1412

Meijer, A., & Webster, C. W. R. (2020). The COVID-19-Crisis and the Information Polity: An Overview of Responses and Discussions in Twenty-One Countries from Six Continents. *Information Polity*, 25(3), 243–274. DOI: 10.3233/IP-200006

Michie, J. (2020). The Covid-19 Crisis and the Future of the Economy and Economics. *International Review of Applied Economics*, 34(3), 301–303. DOI: 10.1080/02692171.2020.1756040

Nugroho, R. (2020). *Kebijakan Anti Pandemi Global: Kasus Covid 19*. Yayasan Rumah Reformasi Kebijakan. [Institute for Policy Reform].

Obermaier, M., Koch, T., & Riesmeyer, C. (2018). Deep Impact? How Journalists Perceive the Influence of Public Relations on Their News Coverage and Which Variables Determine This Impact. *Communication Research*, 45(7), 1031–1053. DOI: 10.1177/0093650215617505

Papapicco, C. (2020). Informative Contagion: The Coronavirus (COVID-19) in Italian journalism. *Online Journal of Communication and Media Technologies*, 10(3), 1–12. DOI: 10.29333/ojcm/7938

Ramadhani, P. I. (2020, April 23). *Kilas Balik Kebijakan Pemerintah Tangani Pandemi Covid-19 – Bisnis Liputan6.com*. Liputan 6. Retrieved from www.liputan6.com/bisnis/read/4235729/kilas-balik-kebijakan-pemerintah-tangani-pandemi-covid-19

Raphael Ojebuyi, B., & Francis Adekoya, O. (2020). *In Media We Trust*

Versus the Media We Trust: Information Subsidies and Credibility of Editorial Content in Nigerian Newspapers. Journal of Communication and Media Research, 12(1), 1–11. Retrieved from <https://jcmrjournal.org/article/409>

Reese, S. D. (2008). Prologue – Framing Public Life: A Bridging Model for Media Research. In S. D. Reese, O. H. Gandy, & A. E. Grant (Eds.), *FRAMING PUBLIC LIFE Perspectives on Media and Our Understanding of the Social World* (pp. 23 – 48). Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Inc. DOI: 10.4102/sajcd.v53i1.198

Sallot, L. M., & Johnson, E. A. (2006). Investigating Relationships between Journalists and Public Relations Practitioners: Working Together to Set, Frame and Build the Public Agenda, 1991-2004. *Public Relations Review*, 32(2), 151–159. DOI: 10.1016/j.pubrev.2006.02.008

Sherwood, M., & Nicholson, M. (2017). Who Controls Sports News? Media Relations and Information Subsidies in Australian Sport Media. *Media International Australia*, 165(1), 146–156. DOI: 10.1177/1329878X17713340

Shiang, L. S., Chibundu, I. S., & Wilson, S. J. A. (2020). Media Coverage of Malaysian Airline Flight MH370: A Preliminary Study on the Framing of the Crisis in the Malaysian Mainstream and Alternative Newspapers. *Jurnal Komunikasi: Malaysian Journal of Communication*, 36(1), 90–108. DOI: 10.17576/JKMJC-2020-3601-06

Solomon, S., Rostellato, D., Testoni, I., Calabrese, F., & Biasco, G. (2021). Journalistic Denial of Death during the Very First Traumatic Period of the Italian COVID-19 Pandemic. *Behavioral Sciences*, 11(3), 41. DOI: 10.3390/bs11030041

Sukmayadi, V. (2019). The Dynamics of Media Landscape and Media Policy in Indonesia. *Asia Pacific Media Educator*, 29(1), 58–67. DOI: 10.1177/1326365X19844853

Sweetser, K. D., & Brown, C. W. (2008). Information Subsidies and Agenda-Building during the Israel-Lebanon Crisis. *Public Relations Review*, 34(4), 359–366. DOI: 10.1016/j.pubrev.2008.06.008

Tapsell, R. (2017). Media Power in Indonesia; Oligarch, Citizens and the Digital Revolutions. *Asian Journal of Communication*, 30(5), 1–2. DOI: 10.1080/01292986.2020.1808690

Tenenboim-Weinblatt, K., & Baden, C. (2018). Journalistic Transformation: How Source Texts are Turned into News Stories. *Journalism*, 19(4), 481–499. DOI: 10.1177/1464884916667873

Tiffen, R., Jones, P. K., Rowe, D., Aalberg, T., Coen, S., Curran, J., Hayashi, K., Iyengar, S., Mazzoleni, G., Papathanassopoulos, S., Rojas, H., & Soroka, S. (2014). Sources in the News: A Comparative Study. *Journalism Studies*, 15(4), 374–391. DOI:

10.1080/1461670X.2013.831239

Veil, S. R., & Ojeda, F. (2010). Establishing Media Partnerships in Crisis Response. *Communication Studies*, 61(4), 412–429. DOI: 10.1080/10510974.2010.491336

Wilkins, L. (2005). Plagues, Pestilence and Pathogens: The Ethical Implications of News Reporting of a World Health Crisis. *Asian Journal of Communication*, 15(3), 247–254. DOI: 10.1080/01292980500260698

Yuen, K. F., Wang, X., Ma, F., & Li, K. X. (2020). The Psychological Causes of Panic Buying Following a Health Crisis. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 17(10), 3–14. DOI: 10.3390/ijerph17103513

VINISA NURUL AISYAH. Lecturer at the Communication Science Department, Faculty of Communication and Informatics, Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta, Indonesia. Research interests include journalism, media, cultural studies, and gender studies. Collaboration on this article: theoretical and methodological procedures, data analysis, data coding, discussion and results, writing of the manuscript, and review and revision of the final version. E-mail: Vna409@ums.ac.id

DIMAS ARYO ANGGORO. Lecturer at the Informatics Department, Faculty of Communication and Informatics, Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta, Indonesia. Research interests include data mining and social informatics. Collaboration on this article: data mining, discussion and results, review and approval of the final version. E-mail: daa310@ums.ac.id

TRANSLATED BY: LEE SHARP